John Alan McDonald
916 10th Ave E #C
Seattle WA 98102 USA
2007-05-06

COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Concerning patent application: Segmentation of Left Ventriculogram using
Boosted Decision Trees
Applicants: McDonald et al.
Serial No. 10/626,028
Filed: July 24, 2003
Examiner: Conover, Damon M.

Dear Sirs:

On March 28, 2007, Sabrina MacIntyre, from the Law Offices of Ronald Anderson, submitted an Amendment and Request for Reconsideration of the above patent application. I am the principal inventor. The amendment was submitted without the knowledge or prior review of the inventors. The amendment contains significant errors. In my latest communication with Ronald Anderson, he has not agreed to correct those errors, so I am writing independently.

We discussed this invention at some length with Ron Anderson in 2003. This is my understanding of the conclusions of those conversations:

(a) None of the individual steps in the process are original. They are standard techniques and methods familiar to anyone of 'ordinary skill' in the fields of image processing, computer vision, and machine learning.

(b) The overall structure of the process (the general kinds of steps and their sequence) is also not original; it is a widely used approach to image segmentation.

(c) The bulk of my effort was devoted to a series of experiments to determine a specific combination of steps that would permit sufficiently accurate pixel classification. The individual steps not novel, only the specific combination may be.

The examiner rejected claims 1 and 11, and Ms MacIntyre defended those claims, on the issue of whether individual steps were or were not novel. Both arguments contain errors —- for example, confusing meshes and images —- but these errors are irrelevant, since no claim of novelty can be defended for any individual step.

Please let me know if you have questions or if I can provide any further assistance. The best way to reach me is via email: jamcdonald@att.net

Thank you for your attention.

John Alan McDonald